Change Request #: 276
Assigned OGC Document #: 13-020
Name: Clemens Portele
Organization: interactive instruments
Email: portele@interactive-instruments.de

Document Name/Version: Geography Markup Language (GML) Encoding Standard / 3.2.1
OGC Project Document: 07-036

If this is a revision of a previous submission and you have a Change Request Number, then check here: ☐
Enter the CR number here: ☐
Enter the Revision Number that you are revising here: ☐

Title: [GML 3.3 SWG] Values of GML properties
Source: GML SWG discussion
Work item code: ☐
Category: F (Critical correction)

Reason for change:
The current text in GML 3.2.1, section 21.2.7 states: "If the value of the property is expected to be represented inline, the type of the property element shall support this, either by having XML Schema simple content of the appropriate simple type or by containing the GML object that is the value of the property inline (see 21.2.6)."

This requirement is too restrictive and not inline with the original intention, the text in Clause 7 and current practice. The quoted text limits the values of a GML property to GML objects (i.e. "XML elements of a type derived from AbstractGMLType") and prohibits that a GML property may have a value that is an XML element from some other XML grammar.

However, sub-clauses 7.1.1 and 7.2.3 were written with the intention that property values are not restricted to GML objects as expressed in the patterns specified in 7.2.3.

Conclusion: The statement in 21.2.7 is an error needs to be changed in a corrigendum.

Summary of change:
This change should be published as a corrigendum.
Change the second paragraph in 21.2.7 to:
"If the value of the property is expected to be available elsewhere, the type of the property element shall support referencing the XML element that implements the data type of the property (see 21.2.6)."

Change the third paragraph in 21.2.7 to:

"If the value of the property is expected to be represented inline, the type of the property element shall support this, either by having XML Schema simple content of the appropriate simple type or by containing the XML element implementing the data type of the property (see 21.2.6)."

Add a new fourth paragraph in 21.2.7:

"If the XML element implementing the data type of the property is specified in a GML application schema or has been declared in the GML namespace, it shall be a GML object."

In 21.2.6 replace "GML object" by "XML element" and add a new paragraph before the note:

"If the XML element is specified in a GML application schema or has been declared in the GML namespace, it shall be a GML object."

Consequences if not approved: The requirements in Clause 7 and Clause 21 are inconsistent, which creates confusion.

Clauses affected: 21.2.6 and 21.2.7

Additional Documents affected:

Supporting Documentation:

Comments: In addition, it should be noted that in practice, references to remote property values sometimes also reference resources that are not available in an XML representation. The current requirements in Clause 7 (and 21) are probably too restrictive. In the future it should also be considered to add a conformance class that supports references to other representations than XML.

Status: Assigned

Assigned To: GML 3.3 SWG

Disposition: Referred